

Original Article

The Impact of Tourism Villages Regulations to Achieve Sustainable Villages Tourism

Abdul Kadir Jaelani ^{1,*}, Dinda Aprilia ², Bobur Sobirov ³, Erkinboy Rakhimovich Abdullaev ⁴

¹ Faculty of Law, Universitas Sebelas Maret Surakarta, Surakarta, Indonesia.

² Lembaga Contrarius Indonesia, Surakarta, Indonesia.

⁴ Samarkand Branch of Tashkent State University of Economics, Samarkand, Uzbekistan.

³ President, CEO Eric Consulting LLC, Notary Public State of Ohio, USA.

*Corresponding Author: jaelanabdulkadir@staff.uns.ac.id

Abstract

Tourism constitutes a concurrent governmental function in Indonesia, whereby regional governments are vested with the authority to regulate and manage tourism development, including the governance of tourist villages. Despite the incorporation of sustainable tourism principles into national legislation as a means of supporting the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), particularly through the integration of economic, environmental, social, and cultural considerations, legal scholarship remains limited in critically examining the effectiveness of their implementation at the regional level. This gap is especially evident in the context of forest-based tourist villages. This study aims to examine the implementation of sustainable tourism principles as stipulated in national legislation in the management of tourist villages located within forest areas of Karanganyar Regency and to analyze the implications of such implementation for social, economic, cultural, and environmental dimensions. This research employs a normative legal research method, focusing on the analysis of statutory regulations, legal doctrines, and relevant policy instruments, and adopts a prescriptive analytical approach. The findings demonstrate, first, that the existing normative framework governing sustainable tourist village management has contributed to local economic development and is aligned with Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 8 concerning decent work and economic growth. Second, the study finds that significant deficiencies persist in practical implementation, particularly with regard to environmental management and the enforcement of tourism regulations. Third, these deficiencies indicate a structural disparity between normative legal objectives and their realization in practice, reflecting weaknesses in regional governance and institutional coordination. The study concludes that regulatory refinement and strengthened governance mechanisms are necessary to ensure legally consistent, environmentally sustainable, and socially inclusive tourist village management in forest areas.

Keywords: Ecological; Justice; Sustainability; Tourism; Regulation; Villages;

Introduction

Tourism is a crucial sector in regional development, as stipulated in Article 12, paragraph (3), letter b of Law Number 23 of 2014 about Regional Government, which designates tourism as a concurrent governmental responsibility.¹ This means that local governments have the authority to set policies in the implementation and management of tourism in their areas.² One form of implementation of this authority is through the development of tourism

¹ Supriyadi A. Arief and Rahmat Teguh Santoso Gobel, "The Issue of Village Communities Constitutional Rights on Supervision of Village Head Election", *Jurnal Konstitusi*, 19.4 (2022), 886–908 <<https://doi.org/10.31078/JK1946>>.

² Budiman and Abdul Kadir, "The Policy of Sustainable Waste Management Towards Sustainable Development Goals", *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 3.1 (2023), 70–94 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v3i1.73>>.



villages, which provide space for villages to manage and develop their tourism potential independently.³ This initiative seeks to diversify the economy and enhance the income of rural communities while also serving as a crucial component in the attainment of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).⁴

The efforts to develop tourist villages by the local government cannot be separated from the need for a sustainable approach, recognizing that tourism influences not just economic factors but also the environmental and socio cultural dimensions of the local community.⁵ In this context, the application of sustainable tourism is crucial to ensure that the management of tourism villages yields long term benefits while preserving local values and existing ecosystems.⁶ Sunaryo said that tourism that is not designed in a sustainable manner often has a negative impact, both in the social, cultural, and economic fields.⁷ Therefore, sustainable tourism is present as a solution to answer these various challenges by prioritizing three main pillars, namely community involvement, environmental conservation, and balanced local economic development.⁸ The objective of this strategy is to establish equilibrium among community revenue, conservation of local values, and environmental safeguarding in tourism areas.⁹

Article 2, letter h of Law Number 10 of 2009 on Tourism stipulates that tourism implementation must adhere to the principle of sustainability.¹⁰ This mandate is further detailed in the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Number 9 of 2021, which delineates the guidelines for sustainable tourism destinations across four primary pillars: sustainable management, socio economic sustainability, cultural sustainability, and environmental sustainability.¹¹ In this context, ecological justice is established as a core principle, highlighting the significance of equality for both humans and non human entities, as well as the environment at large.¹² This principle advocates for a balanced consideration of social, ecological, and economic interests not solely from an

³ Sotear Ellis and Lynnaire Sheridan, 'A Critical Reflection on the Role of Stakeholders in Sustainable Tourism Development in Least-Developed Countries', *Tourism Planning and Development*, 11.4 (2014), 467–71 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/21568316.2014.894558>>.

⁴ United Nation, 'Policy Brief: COVID-19 and Transforming Tourism', United Nation, 2020.

⁵ Ery Atmodjo, Machiel Lamers and Arthur P.J. Mol, 'Governing Dynamics in Marine Conservation Tourism in Raja Ampat, Indonesia', *Tourism Planning and Development*, 17.6 (2020), 655–73 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/21568316.2019.1686652>>.

⁶ Elham Falatoonitoosi, Vikki Schaffer and Don Kerr, 'Does Sustainable Tourism Development Enhance Destination Prosperity?', *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Research*, 46.5 (2022), 1056–82 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/1096348020988328>>.

⁷ Tien Ming Cheng and others, 'Community Participation as a Mediating Factor on Residents' Attitudes towards Sustainable Tourism Development and Their Personal Environmentally Responsible Behaviour', *Current Issues in Tourism*, 22.14 (2019), 1764–82 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2017.1405383>>.

⁸ I Gede Surya Pratama, 'The Impact of Tourism Development on the Economic, Cultural and Environmental Aspects of Local Communities', *International Research Journal of Management, IT and Social Sciences*, 2020 <<https://doi.org/10.21744/IRJMIS.V7N1.819>>.

⁹ Tomi Agfianto, Made Antara and I Wayan Suardana, 'Dampak Ekonomi Pengembangan Community Based Tourism Terhadap Masyarakat Lokal Di Kabupaten Malang (Studi Kasus Destinasi Wisata Cafe Sawah Pujon Kidul)', *Jurnal Master Parivisata (JUMPA)*, 5.2 (2019) <<https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.24843/JUMPA.2018.v05.i02.p03>>.

¹⁰ Sugeng Widodo, 'Reformulation of Regional Autonomy Strategy for Tourism Development in Indonesia', *International Journal of Economics, Business and Management Studies*, 6.1 (2019), 247–60 <<https://doi.org/10.20448/802.61.247.260>>.

¹¹ Johan Hultman and Filippa Säwe, 'Absence and Presence of Social Complexity in the Marketization of Sustainable Tourism', *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 111 (2016), 327–35 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JCLEPRO.2014.11.053>>.

¹² Shahrukh Khalid and others, 'Community Empowerment and Sustainable Tourism Development: The Mediating Role of Community Support for Tourism', *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 11.22 (2019) <<https://doi.org/10.3390/SU11226248>>.



economic standpoint, but from a holistic perspective that ensures the well-being of all living beings and natural systems.¹³

However, the implementation of tourist village management on the ground particularly in forest areas of Karanganyar Regency, which possesses extensive ecological functions still faces several challenges. One such issue is the mismanagement of tourism activities within these forest zones.¹⁴ A notable example can be observed in the protected forest area of Mount Lawu, specifically within the village of Gondosuli, Tawangmangu District, where long-accumulated waste has been discovered.¹⁵ Reports indicate that approximately 50 tons of garbage have built up in this area, highlighting serious shortcomings in sustainable tourism practices and environmental governance¹⁶. Alongside environmental concerns, other obstacles persist in the administration of tourist villages in Karanganyar Regency, suggesting that the application of sustainable tourism concepts has not been fully realized.¹⁷ The issues encompass the restricted participation of local communities in decision-making, the absence of fair income distribution systems, the neglect of environmental sustainability, and inadequate measures to safeguard local culture. This condition reflects a gap between the normative ideals that should be applied (*das sollen*) and the actual practices on the ground (*das sein*), making it difficult to fully achieve a tourism model that is just, inclusive, and sustainable.¹⁸

The problem of forest area tourism management is also related to the lack of educational facilities and environmental conservation education provided to tourists, which should be in accordance with Article 3 paragraph (1) points a and c of Permen LHK Number 13 of 2020. The construction of natural tourism amenities and infrastructure in forest areas must adhere to principles of conservation and education. Forest damage is still found due to the development of tourist facilities in protected forest areas in Karanganyar Regency, such as in Gondosuli, Tawangmangu District, covering an area of 4 hectares¹⁹. It was found that forest destruction was done using heavy equipment that was planned to be built for culinary tourism by taking advantage of the natural beauty that occurred at RPH Tlogodlingo, BKPH North Lawu, KPH Surakarta located in Blumbang Village, Tawangmangu.²⁰ This issue illustrates that the tourism sector continues to focus economic factors, neglecting the significance of social, cultural, and environmental sustainability in alignment with the ideals of sustainable tourism. Consequently, legal and policy frameworks are required to integrate the principle of ecological justice, ensuring the continuous and thorough implementation of sustainable tourism.²¹

Previous research has examined various aspects of sustainable tourism and rural tourism development that are relevant to the study of tourism village regulation. Li, Ismail, and Aminuddin (2024), in *How Has Rural Tourism Influenced the Sustainable Development of Traditional Villages? A Systematic Literature Review* concluded that sustainable village development requires

¹³ Brian Baxter, *A Theory of Ecological Justice*.

¹⁴ Moh Fadli and others, 'The Legal Construction of Spirituality, Ethical and Sustainable Tourism of Temples in Malang Raya, Indonesia', *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 35.2 (2021), 515–24 <<https://doi.org/10.30892/GTG.35232-679>>.

¹⁵ Dinda Aprilia, Abdul Kadir Jaelani and Itok Dwi, 'Regulatory Model for Tourism Villages in Forest Areas Based on Sustainable Tourism', *Legality: Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum*, 33.1 (2025), 286–306 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22219/ljh.v33i1.40177>>.

¹⁶ (Suara Merdeka Solo, n.d.)

¹⁷ Alda Rifada Rizqi, 'Meaningful Participation in Local Regulation Making in Indonesia: A Study of Legislative Law', *Rechtsidée*, 10.2 (2022) <<https://doi.org/10.21070/JIHR.V11I0.801>>.

¹⁸ Aulia Basundhari Widyaningsih, Istjabatul Aliyah and Rufia Andisetyana Putri, 'Kesesuaian Sepuluh Destinasi Wisata Terhadap Konsep Community-Based Tourism Di Kecamatan Ngargoyoso, Karanganyar', *Region: Jurnal Pembangunan Wilayah Dan Perencanaan Partisipatif*, 17.2 (2022), 535–54 <<https://doi.org/10.20961/region.v17i2.43886>>.

¹⁹ (Radar Solo, n.d.)

²⁰ (Espos.Id | Espos Indonesia Dari Solo Untuk Indonesia, n.d.)

²¹ John B. Cobb Jr, *Sustainability: Economics, Ecology, and Justice* (New York: Orbis Books, 1992).



the prioritization of community values and participation alongside economic activities.²² Hu, Chen, and Huang (2025), in *Dynamic Knowledge Practices in Tourism Village Development: An Activity Theory Perspective*, found that the marginalization of indigenous knowledge and limited community capacity constrain effective tourism village development despite the adoption of formal development models.²³ A case study also examined tourism villages in Bali and emphasized the importance of customary institutions and community involvement in environmental conservation and balanced resource management.²⁴ Additional research in *Assessing Sustainability in Rural Tourism*, also highlighted that rural tourism contributes to economic and cultural development but continues to face challenges related to environmental degradation and inadequate policy planning.²⁵ Furthermore, studies on smart ecotourism village models underscore the need to integrate spatial justice, environmental planning, and governance mechanisms to enhance sustainable rural tourism.²⁶ Collectively, these studies contribute to the understanding of sustainable tourism dynamics but reveal a significant research gap in normative legal analyses that examine tourism village regulations as legal instruments for achieving sustainability objectives.

This research aims to examine the extent to which sustainable tourism principles, as stipulated in national legislation, have been implemented by local authorities in the management of tourist villages located within forest areas of Karanganyar Regency. The study further seeks to analyze the implications of such implementation for social, economic, cultural, and environmental dimensions of tourist village governance. Particular attention is given to the interaction between regulatory frameworks and practical management practices, as well as their contribution to sustainable development objectives. Through this analysis, the research evaluates whether existing tourism governance mechanisms effectively promote balanced economic growth, environmental protection, and the preservation of local socio-cultural values.

Method

This study used a normative legal research methodology to examine legal norms, concepts, and ideas²⁷. This study employs a statutory approach, involving the review and analysis of all laws and regulations pertinent to the research topics, alongside a conceptual approach, which entails the examination and analysis of evolving views and doctrines within the legal study relevant to the discussed research topic. This study utilizes primary and secondary legal materials. Primary legal materials consist of laws and regulations, specifically the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, Law Number 10 of 2009 regarding Tourism, Permenparekraf Number 9 of 2021 on Guidelines for Sustainable Tourism, Regional Regulation of Karanganyar Regency Number 1 of 2024 concerning Tourism Villages, Regional Regulation Number 8 of 2016 on Tourism, and Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2016 pertaining to the Master Plan for Tourism Development of Karanganyar

²² Li Yanan, Muhammad Azzam Ismail and Asrul Aminuddin, 'How Has Rural Tourism Influenced the Sustainable Development of Traditional Villages? A Systematic Literature Review', *Helijon*, 10.4 (2024), e25627 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.helijon.2024.e25627>>.

²³ Xianyang Hu, Jie Chen and Songshan (Sam) Huang, 'Dynamic Knowledge Practices in Tourism Village Development: An Activity Theory Perspective', *Tourism Management*, 113 (2026), 105316 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2025.105316>>.

²⁴ Putu Devi Rosalina and others, 'Rural Tourism Resource Management Strategies: A Case Study of Two Tourism Villages in Bali', *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 49 (2023), 101194 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2023.101194>>.

²⁵ Maider Samper-Mendivil, Maria Elena Aramendia-Muneta and Rocío Alarcón-López, 'Assessing Sustainability in Rural Tourism: Insights from Accommodation Managers and Residents in Navarre', *Journal of Rural Studies*, 120 (2025), 103866 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2025.103866>>.

²⁶ Hande UYAR OĞUZ and Ahmet ASLAN, 'Redesigning Rural Space through Smart Ecotourism Villages: A Model Proposal Based on TOE Theory', *Cities*, 168 (2026), 106465 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cities.2025.106465>>.

²⁷ Soerjono Soekanto and Sri Mamudji, *Penelitian Hukum Normatif: Suatu Tinjauan Singkat Cetakan Ke 17* (Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2015).



Regency for 2016 – 2026. Subsequently, secondary legal materials comprising books, journal articles, and expert legal opinions pertinent to the research issue. These legal resources are gathered via library research for qualitative analysis.

Results and Discussions

The Concept of Sustainable Tourism

Sustainable tourism constitutes an environmental development yielding beneficial effects on the environment, perceivable both presently and in the future.²⁸ The notion of sustainable tourism originated from the principle of sustainable development, introduced by the World Commission on Environment and Development (WCED) in 1987. Subsequently, the World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) elaborated on sustainability, defining sustainable tourism as a form of tourism that emphasizes environmental sustainability, cultural and social dimensions, and global welfare impacts.²⁹ This idea signifies that the fundamentals of sustainability involve the optimal utilization of resources while concurrently preserving and enhancing the quality of the natural environment.³⁰ Three interrelated elements are essential for the construction and advancement of sustainable tourism, and their integration will enhance the community's quality of life³¹, these three elements include: Tourism, the tourism industry is something that can improve the economy in the form of jobs, increase income, support investment, and increase opportunities for business development.³² Environment, the thing that encourages tourism to last a long time is that the model and level of tourism activities must be proportional to the available capacity, both natural and artificial resources and community, improving people's living standards is a key aspect.³³ When the community participates in all activities, it cultivates drive and a sense of responsibility for the decisions rendered.³⁴

Law Number 10 of 2009 about Tourism, Article 1, Paragraph 3 defines tourism as an activity that is promoted and encouraged by the community, entrepreneurs, the government, and local authorities. Tourism serves to augment state revenue, enhance public welfare, stimulate economic progress, alleviate poverty, address unemployment, and conserve nature, the environment, and resources.³⁵ The Tourism Law mandates that tourism implementation adhere to the notion of sustainability, which includes the preservation of nature and the environment.³⁶ Based on the aforementioned arguments, it can be stated that sustainable tourism encompasses practices that prioritize not just economic considerations but also environmental factors and natural resources, ensuring benefits for both the present and

²⁸ Bill Bramwell and Bernard Lane, 'Sustainable Tourism: An Evolving Global Approach', *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 1.1 (1993), 1–5 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/09669589309514792>>.

²⁹ Irwan Tamrin, 'Dari Sejarah Menuju Pengembangan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan: Studi Kasus Kampung Wisata Pancer', *Jurnal Master Pariwisata (JUMPA)*, 8.1 (2021), 152 <<https://doi.org/10.24843/jumpa.2021.v08.i01.p08>>.

³⁰ Putu Diah Sastri Pinantri, 'Override Parade : Isu-Isu Pariwisata Berkelanjutan Pada Destinasi Kepulauan Di Indonesia', *Media Wisata*, 7.2 (2019), 141 <<https://doi.org/10.36276/mws/v17i2>>.

³¹ United Nations Environment Programme and World Tourism Organization, *Making Tourism More Sustainable A Guide for Policy Makers*, UNEP, WTO, 2005.

³² Ralf Isenmann, 'Industrial Ecology: Shedding More Light on Its Perspective of Understanding Nature as Model', *Sustainable Development*, 11.3 (2003), 143–58 <<https://doi.org/10.1002/SD.213>>.

³³ Florian J. Eitzenberger and Tatjana Thimm, 'Perception Disparity: Analyzing the Destination Image of Uzbekistan among Residents and Non-Visitors', *Journal of Destination Marketing and Management*, 34 (2024) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JDMM.2024.100946>>.

³⁴ Gde Indra Bhaskara and others, 'Innovation and Creativity in a Time of Crisis: A Perspective of Small Tourism Enterprises from an Emerging Destination', *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 46 (2023) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.TMP.2023.101093>>.

³⁵ Pemerintah Indonesia, *Undang-Undang Nomor 10 Tahun 2009 Tentang Kepariwisataan* (Jakarta, 2009).

³⁶ Hamim Farhan and Khoirul Anwar, 'The Tourism Development Strategy Based on Rural and Local Wisdom', *Journal of Sustainable Development*, 9.3 (2016), 170 <<https://doi.org/10.5539/JSD.V9N3P170>>.



future.³⁷ Environmental sustainability can be attained by efficiently utilizing available resources while setting restrictions on their consumption.³⁸ It also entails safeguarding the sustainability and existence of natural heritage and biodiversity, in addition to upholding ecological processes at a tourism destination.³⁹

Sustainability in the economic aspect is demonstrated by tourism activities that are able to reduce poverty levels, create new job opportunities, and ultimately drive economic growth in the area.⁴⁰ Meanwhile, sustainability in the socio-cultural aspect is shown by creating agreements in the form of rules and joint provisions aimed at preserving the social and cultural purity of the community, conserving customs and cultural heritage, and enhancing understanding and tolerance among the cultures in the local community.⁴¹ The governance of sustainable tourism is delineated in Law No. 10 of 2009 on Tourism, Law No. 6 of 2023, which modifies Article 26 letters k and l of the Tourism Law, and Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Regulation No. 9 of 2021 on Guidelines for Sustainable Tourism Destinations.⁴² This framework reflects the stipulations of Article 28 H of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, which asserts that every individual has the right to live prosperously and enjoy a healthy living environment.⁴³ Consequently, the establishment of these regulations aims to foster a conducive and healthy living environment within the tourism sector, wherein the execution of sustainable tourism will guarantee the attainment of environmental sustainability and a salubrious living environment.⁴⁴

The Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Regulation No. 9 of 2021 provides a comprehensive framework for the sustainable management of tourism destinations, aiming to achieve effective protection, utilization, and development of these areas.⁴⁵ Permenparekraf No. 9 of 2021 stipulates that a fundamental requirement for the execution of sustainable tourism destinations is the establishment of an organization responsible for management.⁴⁶ This organization encompasses not only local authorities or public sector entities but also integrates diverse stakeholders, including government, public sector, and private sector participants, to fulfill the objectives.⁴⁷ The regulation explains that, in general, there are four

³⁷ Benjamin Achzet and others, 'How Sustainability Can Get a Competitive Advantage: State of the Art for Stationary Battery Storage Systems', *Cleaner Chemical Engineering*, 10 (2024), 100122 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.CLCE.2024.100122>>.

³⁸ Rizqi.

³⁹ Hyejo Hailey Shin, Miyoung Jeong and Mi Hea Cho, 'The Impact of Smart Tourism Technology and Domestic Travelers' Technology Readiness on Their Satisfaction and Behavioral Intention: A Cross-Country Comparison', *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 23.5 (2021), 726–42 <<https://doi.org/10.1002/JTR.2437>>.

⁴⁰ Purniawati Purniawati, Nikmatul Kasana and Rodiyah Rodiyah, 'Good Environmental Governance in Indonesia (Perspective of Environmental Protection and Management)', *The Indonesian Journal of International Clinical Legal Education*, 2.1 (2020), 43–56 <<https://doi.org/10.15294/IJICLE.V2I1.37328>>.

⁴¹ Irwan Tamrin and others, 'Dari Sejarah Menuju Pengembangan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan: Studi Kasus Kampung Wisata Pancer', *Jurnal Master Pariwisata (JUMPA)*, 8 (2021), 152 <<https://doi.org/10.24843/jumpa.2021.v08.i01.p08>>.

⁴² Megandaru Widhi Kawuryan and others, 'Sustainable Tourism Development in Indonesia: Bibliometric Review and Analysis', *Indonesian Journal of Geography*, 54.1 (2022), 154–66 <<https://doi.org/10.22146/IJG.64657>>.

⁴³ Aqil Teguh Fathani, Roni Ekha Putera, and others, 'A Systematical Review of Tourism Disaster Management: Insights from Indonesian's Journey', *E3S Web of Conferences*, 464 (2023) <<https://doi.org/10.1051/E3SCONF/202346405002>>.

⁴⁴ Muhammad Syafii and Mimma Maripatul Uula, 'Measuring the Productivity of Tourism Sector in Indonesia', *Halal Tourism and Pilgrimage*, 2.2 (2022) <<https://doi.org/10.58968/HTP.V2I2.179>>.

⁴⁵ Dalia Streimikiene and others, 'Sustainable Tourism Development and Competitiveness: The Systematic Literature Review', *Sustainable Development*, 29.1 (2021), 259–71 <<https://doi.org/10.1002/SD.2133>>.

⁴⁶ Francesc González-Reverté, 'Building Sustainable Smart Destinations: An Approach Based on the Development of Spanish Smart Tourism Plans', *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 11.23 (2019), 1–24 <<https://doi.org/10.3390/SU11236874>>.

⁴⁷ Retno Dewi Pramodia Ahsani and others, 'The Challenges and Opportunities for Developing Community-Based Tourism in Indonesia', *Journal of Governance*, 7.4 (2022) <<https://doi.org/10.31506/JOG.V7I4.16232>>.



criteria for sustainable tourism destinations, namely: sustainable management; cultural sustainability; social and economic sustainability; and lastly, environmental sustainability.⁴⁸ The requirements for sustainable tourism destinations are categorised into four main categories, each containing two or three subsections, whereby the assessment indicators and supporting evidence are explicitly detailed in Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Regulation No. 9 of 2024.⁴⁹

The Impact of Tourism Villages Regulations to Achieve Sustainable Villages Tourism

Lawrence M. Friedman explains that law, as an integrated system, must at least consist of three elements⁵⁰ Namely substance, structure, and legal culture (legal system theory). The substance of law relates to the material content of the law as outlined in regulations.⁵¹ An analysis of the tourism related regulations in Karanganyar Regency, specifically Regional Regulation No. 1 of 2024 on Tourism Villages, Regional Regulation No. 8 of 2016 on Tourism, and Regional Regulation No. 6 of 2016 on the Master Plan for Tourism Development in Karanganyar Regency for 2016–2026, reveals that these regulations inadequately embody the principles of ecological justice and sustainable tourism as outlined in the Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Regulation.⁵²

From the articles in these regional regulations, several significant difficulties were identified that indicate the administration of tourism villages in forested regions is not grounded in sustainable tourism principles.⁵³ The substance of these articles does not yet reflect ecological justice.⁵⁴ Ecological justice, as distributive justice, requires a fair distribution of risks and/or benefits from environmental management activities and the policies related to the environment⁵⁵. The fundamental challenges pertaining to this principle are illustrated by the management of trash and the area's carrying capacity. Data reveals a reduction in the percentage of garbage treated in Karanganyar Regency, declining from 76% in 2021 to 74% in 2022.⁵⁶

⁴⁸ Aqil Teguh Fathani, Novia Amira Azmi, and others, 'A Systematic Review of Tourism Governance: Sustainable Tourism Governance Model Post COVID-19', *Jurnal Borneo Administrator*, 19.1 (2023), 35–50 <<https://doi.org/10.24258/JBA.V19I1.1125>>.

⁴⁹ Rodiyah Rodiyah, Siti Hafsyah Idris and Robert Brian Smith, 'Mainstreaming Justice in the Establishment of Laws and Regulations Process: Comparing Case in Indonesia, Malaysia, and Australia', *Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies*, 8.1 (2023), 333–78 <<https://doi.org/10.15294/JILS.V7I2.60096>>.

⁵⁰ Zhe Zhang Tingting Duan, Xue Yang, 'The Improvement of Legal System, Entrepreneur Immigration, and Corporate Cash Holdings', *International Review of Financial Analysis*, 89 (2023) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.irfa.2023.102776>>.

⁵¹ Daniela Alba-Patiño and others, 'Environmental Justice Gaps in Human-Wildlife Conflict Research from a Social-Ecological Systems Perspective', *Biological Conservation*, 312 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIOCON.2025.111515>>.

⁵² Sri Juni Woro Astuti, Sayekti Suindyah Dwiningwari and Suryo Atmojo, 'Modeling Environmental Interactions and Collaborative Interventions for Childhood Stunting: A Case from Indonesia', *Dialogues in Health*, 6 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DIALOG.2025.100206>>.

⁵³ Hari Krishnan Govindarajan and L. S. Ganesh, 'Integrating Energy Governance and Environmental Justice: Role of Renewable Energy', *Renewable Energy Focus*, 43 (2022), 24–36 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.REF.2022.08.006>>.

⁵⁴ Vojtěch Bosák and others, 'Developing Social-Ecological Justice through a Context-Sensitive Reuse of Urban Vacant Spaces', *Environmental Science and Policy*, 159 (2024) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENVSCI.2024.103802>>.

⁵⁵ Melissa Pineda-pinto and others, 'Landscape and Urban Planning Examining Ecological Justice within the Social-Ecological-Technological System of New York City , USA', *Landscape and Urban Planning*, 215 (2021), 104228 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landurbplan.2021.104228>>.

⁵⁶ Pemerintah Daerah Kabupaten Karanganyar, *Peraturan Bupati Karanganyar Nomor 11 Tahun 2023 Tentang Rencana Pembangunan Daerah Kabupaten Karanganyar Tahun 2024-2026*.



Second, the regional regulation does not explain the limits of tourist pressure on specific tourist destinations to prevent over tourism.⁵⁷ Mitigating over-tourism is a vital endeavour to counteract the adverse effects of tourism activities. The adverse effects of over tourism must be monitored and mitigated by planned and systematic measures to ensure the sustainability of tourism in Indonesia.⁵⁸ The core ideas of sustainable tourism development encompass ecological sustainability of the environment surrounding tourist sites and the preservation of the community's social and cultural legacy.⁵⁹ Third, the regional tourism regulation of Karanganyar Regency does not clearly include the mechanism for monitoring and evaluating tourism villages,⁶⁰ so in its implementation, the monitoring and evaluation activities have not been carried out in accordance with the guidelines in the Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Regulation No. 9 of 2021 on Sustainable Tourism Guidelines. Article 13 Paragraph (2) of Regional Regulation No. 1 of 2024 on Tourism Villages states that the re assessment of the feasibility of a tourism village is conducted every 4 years, but in practice, no tourism village in Karanganyar Regency has conducted a re assessment due to the unclear process and mechanism.⁶¹ In this regard, The Indonesian government must mitigate the dangers associated with tourism in high-risk destinations, primarily through monitoring and evaluation efforts.⁶²

Fourth, Article 21 Paragraph (1) and Paragraph (2) of Regional Regulation No. 1 of 2024 on Tourism Villages explains that in an effort to improve community welfare, cooperation with third parties should be conducted, and this cooperation must be witnessed by the Village Head and the regional apparatus responsible for tourism affairs.⁶³ However, in practice, coordination between the tourism village managers, the Village Head, and the Tourism Office in Karanganyar Regency is still weak. Fifth, Article 49 Paragraph (1) of Regional Regulation No. 8 of 2016 on the Organization of Tourism explains that every tourism business is required to have tourism business certification.⁶⁴ However, in practice, many tourism businesses in Karanganyar Regency do not have business certification.⁶⁵ This is partly due to the lack of firmness from the Karanganyar Tourism Office in enforcing business certification and the high cost of financing the certification process.⁶⁶

⁵⁷ Iban Diaz-Parra and Jaime Jover, 'Overtourism, Place Alienation and the Right to the City: Insights from the Historic Centre of Seville, Spain', *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 29.2–3 (2021), 158–75 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/09669582.2020.1717504>>.

⁵⁸ Harry Sutanto and . Nugroho J. Setiadi, 'Overtourism Sebagai Keniscayaan Dalam Pengelolaan Pariwisata Di Indonesia', *Jurnal Altasia*, 2.2 (2020) <<https://doi.org/10.37253/altasia.v2i2.590>>.

⁵⁹ Lis Juliani and Artit Pimpak, 'The Digitalization of Investment Impact on Developing Tourism Industry', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 4.3 (2024), 655–81 <<https://doi.org/10.53955/JHCLS.V4I3.289>>.

⁶⁰ Myrna A. Safitri and Achmad Jaka Santos Adiwijaya, 'Realizing Ecological Justice in Urban Development Laws: Indonesian Experiences and Challenges to Protect Biodiversity in Its New Capital City', *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 1447.1 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/1447/1/012021>>.

⁶¹ Yingji Liu and others, 'The Impact of Environment on Enhancement of Tourism System Resilience in China: The Moderating Role of Digital Technology', *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 206 (2024) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.TECHFORE.2024.123492>>.

⁶² (Sari dkk., 2024)

⁶³ Mohamad Sapari Dwi Hadian and others, 'Urban Geotourism Development in the Perspective of Stakeholders', *International Journal of Geoheritage and Parks*, 13.1 (2025), 102–16 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.IJGEOP.2024.12.001>>.

⁶⁴ Mustafa Rehman Khan and others, 'Analyzing the Impact of Socio-Economic Factors on Environmental Degradation: Empirical Insights from Emerging Economy', *Sustainable Futures*, 10 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SFTR.2025.100967>>.

⁶⁵ Dwi Intan Afidah and others, 'Aspect-Based Sentiment Analysis for Indonesian Tourist Attraction Reviews Using Bidirectional Long Short-Term Memory', *JUITA: Jurnal Informatika*, 11.1 (2023), 27 <<https://doi.org/10.30595/JUITA.V11I1.15341>>.

⁶⁶ Sergio Muñoz Freire and Begoña Muñoz Sar, 'Tourism Intelligence in the Cabo Ortegal UNESCO Global Geopark: Case of San Andrés de Teixido', *International Journal of Geoheritage and Parks*, 13.2 (2025), 290–305 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.IJGEOP.2025.03.002>>.



Sixth, Article 48, letter b, of Regional Regulation No. 6 of 2016 about the Master Plan for Tourism Development in Karanganyar Regency for 2016–2026 stipulates that tourism management necessitates the establishment of inter agency cooperation across several sectors.⁶⁷ Nevertheless, in application, it is known that there is weak coordination between the Tourism Office and the Environmental Agency in ensuring environmental sustainability, especially in addressing waste issues resulting from tourism activities, and weak coordination with the Trade, Manpower, Cooperatives, and MSMEs Office in ensuring intellectual property rights for leading products.⁶⁸

The analysis of the regulatory framework concerning tourism management and tourism villages in Karanganyar Regency indicates that the provisions in these regulations do not incorporate the four principles specified in the guidelines for sustainable tourism management, as mandated by the Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Regulation.⁶⁹ Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Regulation No. 9 of 2021 serves as an implementing regulation of the Tourism Law, delineating specific provisions pertaining to Sustainable Tourism.⁷⁰ Moreover, in comparison to regional regulations, it is evident that the Ministerial Regulation occupies a superior status.⁷¹ The legislation governing the execution of sustainable tourism must be grounded in Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Regulation No. 9 of 2021.⁷²

From the hierarchy of regulations as presented by Jimly Asshiddiqie, who explains the four layers of the hierarchy of legal norms in the new regulatory framework known as functional hierarchy, consisting of (i) the Constitution, (ii) laws as legislative products (legislative acts), (iii) implementing regulations directly under the law (the first implementing delegated regulation), and (iv) implementing regulations under the lowest sub delegation beneath the law (the second lowest implementing sub-delegated regulation).⁷³ Legislative delegation and sub-delegation of rule making power are the foundations of this functional hierarchy, which relies on the delegation of authority to regulate in accordance with the law.⁷⁴

Additionally, the Karanganyar Regency's tourism management policies demonstrate that they are not yet founded on ecological justice, which holds that tourism should help the environment in addition to people in order to stop the planet from being destroyed.⁷⁵ Justice, in this context, should not only focus on economic welfare but should balance the interests

⁶⁷ Samper-Mendívil, Aramendia-Muneta and Alarcón-López.

⁶⁸ Han Shen Chen, 'Sustainable Tourism and Ecological Challenges in Taiwan's Southwest Coast National Scenic Area: An Ecological Footprint and Carrying Capacity Assessment', *Environmental and Sustainability Indicators*, 27 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.INDIC.2025.100863>>.

⁶⁹ Khudzaifah Dimyati and others, 'Indonesia as a Legal Welfare State: A Prophetic-Transcendental Basis', *Heliyon*, 7.8 (2021) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.HELION.2021.E07865>>.

⁷⁰ Muhammad Suhrab, Chen Pinglu and Ningyu Qian, 'Green Road to Sustainability: Impact of Urbanization on Environmental Degradation and the Mitigating Effect of Infrastructure Investment in Belt and Road Initiative Economies', *Sustainable Futures*, 10 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SFTR.2025.101080>>.

⁷¹ Juwita Putri Pratama, Lita Tyesta ALW and Sekar Anggun Gading Pinilih, 'Eksistensi Kedudukan Peraturan Menteri Terhadap Peraturan Daerah Dalam Hierarki Peraturan Perundang-Undangan', *Jurnal Konstitusi*, 19.4 (2022), 886–908 <<https://doi.org/10.31078/jk1946>>.

⁷² Marzellina Hardiyanti and Amalia Diamantina, 'URGENSI OTONOMI DESA DALAM PENGELOLAAN DESA WISATA BERBASIS PEMBANGUNAN BERKELANJUTAN', *Jurnal Komunikasi Hukum (JKH)*, 8.1 (2022), 334–352 <<https://doi.org/10.23887/jkh.v8i1.44410>>.

⁷³ I Putu David Adi Saputra, 'Pentingnya Pariwisata Berkelanjutan Dalam Menjaga Keseimbangan Lingkungan', *AL-MIKRAJ Jurnal Studi Islam Dan Humaniora (E-ISSN 2745-4584)*, 4.02 (2024), 207–17 <<https://doi.org/10.37680/ALMIKRAJ.V4I02.4613>>.

⁷⁴ Fatma Ayu Jati Putri and Jasurbek Rustamovich Ehsonov, 'The Impact of Land Reform Policies on the Sustainable Management of Natural Resources in Local Communities', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 4.2 (2024), 510–37 <<https://doi.org/10.53955/JHCLS.V4I2.197>>.

⁷⁵ Orin Gusta Andini and others, 'Indonesia's Safeguarding of Human Rights to Achieve Sustainable Development Goals: Insights from Australia's Experience', *Journal of Sustainable Development and Regulatory Issues*, 3.1 (2025), 1–28 <<https://doi.org/10.53955/jsderi.v3i1.53>>.



of society, nature, and the economy⁷⁶. Indonesia has officially proclaimed itself as a nation committed to sustainable development. Nonetheless, the objective of sustainable development is not consistently manifested in all governmental policies, particularly regarding environmental matters⁷⁷

The implementation of sustainable tourism in tourist villages contains interrelated multi aspect dimensions. This method aims to enhance tourist visitation while ensuring the sustainability of benefits for local populations, the preservation of nature, and the safeguarding of cultural heritage. According to the UNWTO framework, tourism sustainability is underpinned by three primary pillars: economic, socio cultural, and environmental.⁷⁸ The principles of sustainable tourism must guide tourism management in order to achieve the 12 primary goals of sustainable tourism established by the United Nations Environment and the World Tourism Organisation in 2005.⁷⁹ One of these goals is local control, which aims to empower and involve local communities in planning and decision making regarding the management and future growth of tourism in their area after consulting with other stakeholders.⁸⁰ Community well being aims to preserve and enhance the quality of life within local communities, encompassing social structures and access to resources, amenities, and life support systems, while preventing any kind of social deterioration or exploitation.⁸¹ Social equity aims to ensure an equitable distribution of economic and social advantages derived from tourism among recipient communities, particularly by enhancing opportunities, incomes, and services for the impoverished.⁸²

Sustainable tourism denotes a tourism development strategy that seeks to attain economic advancement and social welfare while preserving the natural environment and local culture.⁸³ It acknowledges that tourism, if not judiciously managed, can result in adverse effects such as environmental degradation, loss of biodiversity, and cultural transformation.⁸⁴ This notion underscores the effective integration of tourism development with the surrounding environment, aiming to minimise adverse impacts while maximising economic and social advantages for local populations.⁸⁵ Sustainable tourism encompasses numerous fundamental principles, including the judicious use of natural resources, the empowerment of local people, the preservation of cultural heritage, the promotion of social equity, and a participatory decision making process.⁸⁶ By implementing these principles, sustainable

⁷⁶ Baxter.

⁷⁷ (Karjoko dkk., 2022)

⁷⁸ World Tourism Organization (UNWTO), *Sustainable Tourism for Development Guidebook* (Spain: Institutional and Corporate Relations Programme, 2013).

⁷⁹ Afmi Apriliani and others, 'Techno-Economic Analysis of Sawdust-Based Trash Cans and Their Contribution to Indonesia's Green Tourism Policy and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)', *ASEAN Journal for Science and Engineering in Materials*, 5.1 (2026), 17–36.

⁸⁰ Nawang Anandhini and Dina Maulina, 'An Evidence-Based Evaluation Framework for Indonesia's Priority Tourism Destinations Program', *Towards Resilient Societies: The Synergy of Religion, Education, Health, Science, and Technology*, 2025, 114–21 <<https://doi.org/10.1201/9781003645542-19>>.

⁸¹ Maryam AlSuwaidi, Djamel Boussaa and Muhammed Madandola, 'Creative Movements and Urban Regeneration in Qatar: The Case of Msheireb in Doha', *Cogent Arts & Humanities*, 13.1 (2026), 2602410 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/23311983.2025.2602410>>.

⁸² United Nations Environment Programme and World Tourism Organization.

⁸³ Ranti Fauza Mayana and Tisni Santika, 'Intellectual Property-Based Financing Scheme for Creative Industry in Indonesia: Policy, Progress, Challenges and Potential Solutions', *The Journal of World Intellectual Property*, 28.1 (2025), 95–113 <<https://doi.org/10.1111/JWIP.12322>>.

⁸⁴ Siyao Ma, 'Enhancing Tourists' Satisfaction: Leveraging Artificial Intelligence in the Tourism Sector', *Pacific International Journal*, 7.3 (2024), 89–98 <<https://doi.org/10.55014/PIJ.V7I3.624>>.

⁸⁵ Adiwan F. Aritenang and others, 'Innovation in Informal Creative Industries: The Case of Indonesia's Creative Kampongs', *Cities*, 160 (2025), 105805 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.CITIES.2025.105805>>.

⁸⁶ Florianus Pruda Muda, 'Community Participation in Indonesian Sustainable Tourism: A Systematic Review of Models, Impacts, and Gaps', *Private Social Sciences Journal*, 5.8 (2025), 125–39 <<https://doi.org/10.55942/PSSJ.V5I8.462>>.



tourism aims to foster economic growth while simultaneously promoting environmental sustainability and enhancing the welfare of local populations⁸⁷.

In developing its products, a tourist village must hold the principles of authenticity, local community, community involvement, attitude, and conservation and carrying capacity.⁸⁸ The entirety necessitates the engagement of local communities in the actualisation of sustainable tourism and tourist settlements.⁸⁹ The management of tourism villages in forest areas, grounded in sustainable tourism and local community engagement, plays a crucial role in the development of these villages. Active community engagement will yield a positive influence.⁹⁰ The influence of sustainable tourism implementation on the management of tourist communities is evident from that sustainable tourism has the main goal of being planned with three objectives,⁹¹ namely profit, environment, and community; generally has a good planning process, long before the destination opens, and involves various parties; oriented to the common interest, with a focus on local interests; controlled and managed mostly or entirely by local people or “green investors” who prioritize profits for local communities; focus on creating experiences, such as inviting tourists to enjoy local food and culture; environmental conservation aspects are a top priority; communities are a top priority because they play a role in the creation of tourism experiences; there is an appreciation of local culture and wisdom, and the largest share of proceeds flows to local communities.⁹² In contrast to conventional tourism concepts where profit is the main goal, it is often not designed in advance by both service providers and visitors and in development; often involves outside labor because the experiences created do not come from local expertise and most of the profits are enjoyed by outsiders as investors and operators⁹³.

Conclusion

The management of tourist villages must adhere to the principles of sustainable tourism, as mandated by the Tourism Law and the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Number 9 of 2021 regarding Sustainable Tourism Guidelines, and grounded in ecological justice. Sustainable management of tourist villages has an impact and influence on achieving increased economic growth, in line with Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 8. However, in its implementation in the field, it is known that the regulation of tourism village management and tourism in Karanganyar Regency still has substantial problems so that environmental problems are still found in the tourism area. Therefore, the Regent and DPRD of Karanganyar Regency need to revise the Regional Tourism Master Plan and Regional Tourism Regulations of Karanganyar Regency which adopt the principles of

⁸⁷ Ida Ayu Putu Widiati and Indah Permatasar, ‘Strategi Pengembangan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan (Sustainable Tourism Development) Berbasis Lingkungan Pada Fasilitas Penunjang Pariwisata Di Kabupaten Badung’, *Kertha Wicaksana*, 16.1 (2022) <<https://doi.org/10.22225/kw.16.1.2022.35-44>>.

⁸⁸ Djulaeka Djulaeka, Makhmud Zulkifli and Tannia Dinda Kumala, ‘Trademark Reconceptualization to Increase the Value of Creative Economy Products Based on Intellectual Property Rights’, 2025, 284–94 <https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-38476-362-7_41>.

⁸⁹ Dinesh Kumar and Nidhi Suthar, ‘Ethical and Legal Challenges of AI in Marketing: An Exploration of Solutions’, *Journal of Information, Communication and Ethics in Society*, 22.1 (2024), 124–44 <<https://doi.org/10.1108/JICES-05-2023-0068>>.

⁹⁰ Azna Abrory Wardana, ‘Integration of Local Wisdom and Legal Certainty in the Development of Tourism Villages in Malang Regency’, *Jurnal Ar Ro’is Mandalika (Armada)*, 5.2 (2025), 110–26 <<https://doi.org/10.59613/ARMADA.V5I2.4851>>.

⁹¹ Willya Achmad, Nunung Nurwati and Rd. Siti Sofro Sidiq, ‘Community Economic Empowerment Through The Development Of Micro And Small And Medium Enterprises: A Case Study In Alamendah Tourism Village’, *Journal of Economic Empowerment Strategy (JEES)*, 6.2 (2023), 99–104 <<https://doi.org/10.23969/JEES.V6I2.9377>>.

⁹² Hariyanto Hariyanto and others, ‘Strategic Roadmap for AI-Driven Sustainable Tourism Development in Indonesia: An Expert-Based MCDM Approach’, *Jurnal Kepariwisataan Indonesia: Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pengembangan Kepariwisataan Indonesia*, 19.1 (2025), 1–14 <<https://doi.org/10.47608/JKI.V19I12025.1-14>>.

⁹³ Pinantri.



sustainable tourism in the implementation indicators and programs carried out in accordance with Permenparekraf Number 9 of 2021 concerning Sustainable Tourism.

References

Achmad, Willy, Nunung Nurwati and Rd Siti Sofro Sidiq, 'Community Economic Empowerment Through The Development Of Micro And Small And Medium Enterprises: A Case Study In Alamendah Tourism Village', *Journal of Economic Empowerment Strategy (JEES)*, 6 (2023), 99–104 <<https://doi.org/10.23969/JEES.V6I2.9377>>

Achzet, Benjamin, Denise Ott, Rica Fleiner, Marvin Gornik, Andrea Thorenz and Christoph Helbig, 'How Sustainability Can Get a Competitive Advantage: State of the Art for Stationary Battery Storage Systems', *Cleaner Chemical Engineering*, 10 (2024), 100122 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.CLCE.2024.100122>>

Afidah, Dwi Intan, Puput Dewi Anggraeni, Muhammad Rizki, Aji Bagus Setiawan and Sharfina Febbi Handayani, 'Aspect-Based Sentiment Analysis for Indonesian Tourist Attraction Reviews Using Bidirectional Long Short-Term Memory', *JUITA: Jurnal Informatika*, 11 (2023), 27 <<https://doi.org/10.30595/JUITA.V11I1.15341>>

Afgianto, Tomi, Made Antara and I Wayan Suardana, 'Dampak Ekonomi Pengembangan Community Based Tourism Terhadap Masyaakat Lokal Di Kabupaten Malang (Studi Kasus Destinasi Wisata Cafe Sawah Pujon Kidul)', *Jurnal Master Pariwisata (JUMPA)*, 5 (2019) <<https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.24843/JUMPA.2018.v05.i02.p03>>

Ahsani, Retno Dewi Pramodia, Catur Wulandari, Chandra Dinata, Novia Amira Azmi and Aqil Teguh Fathani, 'The Challenges and Opportunities for Developing Community-Based Tourism in Indonesia', *Journal of Governance*, 7 (2022) <<https://doi.org/10.31506/JOG.V7I4.16232>>

'Akhirnya, Proyek Pengembangan Wisata Yang Merusak Hutan Lawu Dihentikan - Radar Solo'

Alba-Patiño, Daniela, Berta Martín-López, Miguel Delibes-Mateos, Juan M Requena-Mullor and Antonio J Castro, 'Environmental Justice Gaps in Human-Wildlife Conflict Research from a Social-Ecological Systems Perspective', *Biological Conservation*, 312 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIOCON.2025.111515>>

AlSuwaidi, Maryam, Djamel Boussaa and Muhammed Madandola, 'Creative Movements and Urban Regeneration in Qatar: The Case of Msheireb in Doha', *Cogent Arts & Humanities*, 13 (2026), 2602410 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/23311983.2025.2602410>>

Anandhini, Nawang and Dina Maulina, 'An Evidence-Based Evaluation Framework for Indonesia's Priority Tourism Destinations Program', *Towards Resilient Societies: The Synergy of Religion, Education, Health, Science, and Technology*, 2025, 114–21 <<https://doi.org/10.1201/9781003645542-19>>

Andini, Orin Gusta, Muhammad Ryan, Kachfi Boer, Faculty Law and Universitas Mulawarman, 'Indonesia's Safeguarding of Human Rights to Achieve Sustainable Development Goals: Insights from Australia's Experience', *Journal of Sustainable Development and Regulatory Issues*, 3 (2025), 1–28 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.53955/jsderi.v3i1.53>>

Aprilia, Dinda, Abdul Kadir Jaelani and Itok Dwi, 'Regulatory Model for Tourism Villages in Forest Areas Based on Sustainable Tourism', *Legality : Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum*, 33 (2025), 286–306 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22219/ljih.v33i1.40177>>

Apriliani, Afmi, Cecep Waahyudin, Faisal Tri Ramdani, Abraham Yazdi Martin, Dede Syahrudin, Denny Hernawan, and others, 'Techno-Economic Analysis of Sawdust-Based Trash Cans and Their Contribution to Indonesia's Green Tourism Policy and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)', *ASEAN Journal for Science and Engineering in Materials*, 5 (2026), 17–36

Arief, Supriyadi A and Rahmat Teguh Santoso Gobel, 'The Issue of Village Communities Constitutional Rights on Supervision of Village Head Election', *Jurnal Konstitusi*, 19 (2022), 886–908 <<https://doi.org/10.31078/JK1946>>



Aritenang, Adiwan F, Zalfa Fadilla Anjani, Pingkan Safitri, Fikri Zul Fahmi, Ana Maria Bustamante Duarte, Karin Pfeffer, and others, 'Innovation in Informal Creative Industries: The Case of Indonesia's Creative Kampongs', *Cities*, 160 (2025), 105805 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.CITIES.2025.105805>>

Astuti, Sri Juni Woro, Sayekti Suindyah Dwiningwarni and Suryo Atmojo, 'Modeling Environmental Interactions and Collaborative Interventions for Childhood Stunting: A Case from Indonesia', *Dialogues in Health*, 6 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DIALOG.2025.100206>>

Atmodjo, Ery, Machiel Lamers and Arthur PJ Mol, 'Governing Dynamics in Marine Conservation Tourism in Raja Ampat, Indonesia', *Tourism Planning and Development*, 17 (2020), 655–73 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/21568316.2019.1686652>>

Baxter, Brian, *A Theory of Ecological Justice*

Bhaskara, Gde Indra, Viachaslau Filimonau, Ni Made Sofia Wijaya and Ida Ayu Suryasih, 'Innovation and Creativity in a Time of Crisis: A Perspective of Small Tourism Enterprises from an Emerging Destination', *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 46 (2023) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.TMP.2023.101093>>

Bosák, Vojtěch, Ondřej Slach, Kateřina Ženková, Jan Ženka and Lenka Paszová, 'Developing Social-Ecological Justice through a Context-Sensitive Reuse of Urban Vacant Spaces', *Environmental Science and Policy*, 159 (2024) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENVSCI.2024.103802>>

Budiman and Abdul Kadir, 'The Policy of Sustainable Waste Management Towards Sustainable Development Goals', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 3 (2023), 70–94 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v3i1.73>>

Chen, Han Shen, 'Sustainable Tourism and Ecological Challenges in Taiwan's Southwest Coast National Scenic Area: An Ecological Footprint and Carrying Capacity Assessment', *Environmental and Sustainability Indicators*, 27 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.INDIC.2025.100863>>

Cheng, Tien Ming, Homer C Wu, John Ta Ming Wang and Min Rong Wu, 'Community Participation as a Mediating Factor on Residents' Attitudes towards Sustainable Tourism Development and Their Personal Environmentally Responsible Behaviour', *Current Issues in Tourism*, 22 (2019), 1764–82 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2017.1405383>>

Diaz-Parra, Iban and Jaime Jover, 'Overtourism, Place Alienation and the Right to the City: Insights from the Historic Centre of Seville, Spain', *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 29 (2021), 158–75 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/09669582.2020.1717504>>

Dimyati, Khudzaifah, Haedar Nashir, Elviandri Elviandri, Absori Absori, Kelik Wardiono and Arief Budiono, 'Indonesia as a Legal Welfare State: A Prophetic-Transcendental Basis', *Heliyon*, 7 (2021) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.HELION.2021.E07865>>

Djulaeka, Djulaeka, Makhmud Zulkifli and Tannia Dinda Kumala, 'Trademark Reconceptualization to Increase the Value of Creative Economy Products Based on Intellectual Property Rights', 2025, 284–94 <https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-38476-362-7_41>

Etzenberger, Florian J and Tatjana Thimm, 'Perception Disparity: Analyzing the Destination Image of Uzbekistan among Residents and Non-Visitors', *Journal of Destination Marketing and Management*, 34 (2024) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JDMM.2024.100946>>

Ellis, Sotear and Lynnaire Sheridan, 'A Critical Reflection on the Role of Stakeholders in Sustainable Tourism Development in Least-Developed Countries', *Tourism Planning and Development*, 11 (2014), 467–71 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/21568316.2014.894558>>

Fadli, Moh, Aan Eko Widiarto, Dhiana Puspitawati, Diah Pawestri Maharani, Airin Liemanto, Zainal Arifien, and others, 'The Legal Construction of Spirituality, Ethical and Sustainable Tourism of Temples in Malang Raya, Indonesia', *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 35 (2021), 515–24 <<https://doi.org/10.30892/GTG.35232-679>>

Falatoonitoosi, Elham, Vikki Schaffer and Don Kerr, 'Does Sustainable Tourism



Development Enhance Destination Prosperity?', *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Research*, 46 (2022), 1056–82 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/1096348020988328>>

Farhan, Hamim and Khoirul Anwar, 'The Tourism Development Strategy Based on Rural and Local Wisdom', *Journal of Sustainable Development*, 9 (2016), 170 <<https://doi.org/10.5539/JSD.V9N3P170>>

Fathani, Aqil Teguh, Novia Amirah Azmi, Eko Priyo Purnomo, Sukanya Aimim Tham and Rohana Ahmad, 'A Systematic Review of Tourism Governance: Sustainable Tourism Governance Model Post COVID-19', *Jurnal Borneo Administrator*, 19 (2023), 35–50 <<https://doi.org/10.24258/JBA.V19I1.1125>>

Fathani, Aqil Teguh, Roni Ekha Putera, Asrinaldi, Tengku Rika Valentina, Desy Hariyati, Defny Holidin, and others, 'A Systematical Review of Tourism Disaster Management: Insights from Indonesian's Journey', *E3S Web of Conferences*, 464 (2023) <<https://doi.org/10.1051/E3SCONF/202346405002>>

Freire, Sergio Muñio and Begoña Muñio Sar, 'Tourism Intelligence in the Cabo Ortegal UNESCO Global Geopark: Case of San Andrés de Teixido', *International Journal of Geoheritage and Parks*, 13 (2025), 290–305 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.IJGEOP.2025.03.002>>

González-Reverté, Francesc, 'Building Sustainable Smart Destinations: An Approach Based on the Development of Spanish Smart Tourism Plans', *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 11 (2019), 1–24 <<https://doi.org/10.3390/SU11236874>>

Govindarajan, Hari Krishnan and LS Ganesh, 'Integrating Energy Governance and Environmental Justice: Role of Renewable Energy', *Renewable Energy Focus*, 43 (2022), 24–36 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.REF.2022.08.006>>

Hadian, Mohamad Sapari Dwi, Mochmad Nursiyam Barkah, Ute Lies Siti Khadidjah, Ayu Krishna Yuliawati, Asti Nur Aryanti and Sani Suhardiman, 'Urban Geotourism Development in the Perspective of Stakeholders', *International Journal of Geoheritage and Parks*, 13 (2025), 102–16 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.IJGEOP.2024.12.001>>

Hailey Shin, Hyejo, Miyoung Jeong and Mi Hea Cho, 'The Impact of Smart Tourism Technology and Domestic Travelers' Technology Readiness on Their Satisfaction and Behavioral Intention: A Cross-Country Comparison', *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 23 (2021), 726–42 <<https://doi.org/10.1002/JTR.2437>>

Hardiyanti, Marzellina and Amalia Diamantina, 'URGENSI OTONOMI DESA DALAM PENGELOLAAN DESA WISATA BERBASIS PEMBANGUNAN BERKELANJUTAN', *Jurnal Komunikasi Hukum (JKH)*, 8 (2022), 334–352 <<https://doi.org/10.23887/jkh.v8i1.44410>>

Hariyanto, Hariyanto, Eko Susanto, Bayu Aji, Andar Danova Lastaripar Goeltom and Sri Utari Widayastuti, 'Strategic Roadmap for AI-Driven Sustainable Tourism Development in Indonesia: An Expert-Based MCDM Approach', *Jurnal Kepariwisataan Indonesia: Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pengembangan Kepariwisataan Indonesia*, 19 (2025), 1–14 <<https://doi.org/10.47608/JKI.V19I12025.1-14>>

Hu, Xianyang, Jie Chen and Songshan (Sam) Huang, 'Dynamic Knowledge Practices in Tourism Village Development: An Activity Theory Perspective', *Tourism Management*, 113 (2026), 105316 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2025.105316>>

Hultman, Johan and Filippa Säwe, 'Absence and Presence of Social Complexity in the Marketization of Sustainable Tourism', *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 111 (2016), 327–35 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JCLEPRO.2014.11.053>>

Isenmann, Ralf, 'Industrial Ecology: Shedding More Light on Its Perspective of Understanding Nature as Model', *Sustainable Development*, 11 (2003), 143–58 <<https://doi.org/10.1002/SD.213>>

Jr, John B. Cobb, *Sustainability: Economics, Ecology, and Justice* (New York: Orbis Books, 1992)

Julianti, Lis and Artit Pimpak, 'The Digitalization of Investment Impact on Developing Tourism Industry', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 4 (2024), 655–81 <<https://doi.org/10.53955/JHCLS.V4I3.289>>



Karjoko, Lego, I Gusti Ayu Ketut Rachmi Handayani, Abdul Kadir Jaelani and Muhammad Jihadul Hayat, 'Indonesia's Sustainable Development Goals Resolving Waste Problem: Informal to Formal Policy', *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning*, 17 (2022), 649–58 <[https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.18280/ijsdp.170230](https://doi.org/10.18280/ijsdp.170230)>

Kawuryan, Megandaru Widhi, Aqil Teguh Fathani, Eko Priyo Purnomo, Lubna Salsabila, Novia Amira Azmi, Deni Setiawan, and others, 'Sustainable Tourism Development in Indonesia: Bibliometric Review and Analysis', *Indonesian Journal of Geography*, 54 (2022), 154–66 <<https://doi.org/10.22146/IJG.64657>>

Khalid, Shahrukh, Muhammad Shakil Ahmad, T Ramayah, Jinsoo Hwang and Insin Kim, 'Community Empowerment and Sustainable Tourism Development: The Mediating Role of Community Support for Tourism', *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 11 (2019) <<https://doi.org/10.3390/SU11226248>>

Khan, Mustafa Rehman, Ismail Khan, Muhammad Umar, Arsalan Mujahid Ghouri, Keoy Kay Hooi and Ai Fen Lim, 'Analyzing the Impact of Socio-Economic Factors on Environmental Degradation: Empirical Insights from Emerging Economy', *Sustainable Futures*, 10 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SFTR.2025.100967>>

Kumar, Dinesh and Nidhi Suthar, 'Ethical and Legal Challenges of AI in Marketing: An Exploration of Solutions', *Journal of Information, Communication and Ethics in Society*, 22 (2024), 124–44 <<https://doi.org/10.1108/JICES-05-2023-0068>>

Lane, Bill Bramwell and Bernard, 'Sustainable Tourism: An Evolving Global Approach', *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 1 (1993), 1–5 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/09669589309514792>>

Liu, Yingji, Yi Hou, Ju Guo and Chuangye Yan, 'The Impact of Environment on Enhancement of Tourism System Resilience in China: The Moderating Role of Digital Technology', *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 206 (2024) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.TECHFORE.2024.123492>>

Ma, Siyao, 'Enhancing Tourists' Satisfaction: Leveraging Artificial Intelligence in the Tourism Sector', *Pacific International Journal*, 7 (2024), 89–98 <<https://doi.org/10.55014/PIJ.V7I3.624>>

Mayana, Ranti Fauza and Tisni Santika, 'Intellectual Property-Based Financing Scheme for Creative Industry in Indonesia: Policy, Progress, Challenges and Potential Solutions', *The Journal of World Intellectual Property*, 28 (2025), 95–113 <<https://doi.org/10.1111/JWIP.12322>>

Muda, Florianus Pruda, 'Community Participation in Indonesian Sustainable Tourism: A Systematic Review of Models, Impacts, and Gaps', *Priviet Social Sciences Journal*, 5 (2025), 125–39 <<https://doi.org/10.55942/PSSJ.V5I8.462>>

Pemerintah Daerah Kabupaten Karanganyar, *Peraturan Bupati Karanganyar Nomor 11 Tahun 2023 Tentang Rencana Pembangunan Daerah Kabupaten Karanganyar Tahun 2024-2026*

Pemerintah Indonesia, *Undang-Undang Nomor 10 Tahun 2009 Tentang Kepariwisataan* (Jakarta, 2009)

Perusakan Hutan Karanganyar: Polisi Tetapkan Pelaksana Proyek Sebagai Tersangka - Espos.Id | Espos Indonesia Dari Solo Untuk Indonesia'

Pinanatri, Putu Diah Sastri, 'Override Parade : Isu-Isu Pariwisata Berkelanjutan Pada Destinasi Kepulauan Di Indonesia', *Media Wisata*, 7 (2019), 141 <<https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.36276/mws/v17i2>>

Pineda-pinto, Melissa, Pablo Herreros-cantis, Timon Mcphearson, Niki Frantzeskaki, Jing Wang and Weiqi Zhou, 'Landscape and Urban Planning Examining Ecological Justice within the Social-Ecological-Technological System of New York City , USA', *Landscape and Urban Planning*, 215 (2021), 104228 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landurbplan.2021.104228>>

Pratama, I Gede Surya, 'The Impact of Tourism Development on the Economic, Cultural and Environmental Aspects of Local Communities', *International Research Journal of Management, IT and Social Sciences*, 2020 <<https://doi.org/10.21744/IRJMIS.V7N1.819>>



Pratama, Juwita Putri, Lita Tyesta ALW and Sekar Anggun Gading Pinilih, 'Eksistensi Kedudukan Peraturan Menteri Terhadap Peraturan Daerah Dalam Hierarki Peraturan Perundang-Undangan', *Jurnal Konstitusi*, 19 (2022), 886–908 <<https://doi.org/10.31078/jk1946>>

Purniawati, Purniawati, Nikmatul Kasana and Rodiyah Rodiyah, 'Good Environmental Governance in Indonesia (Perspective of Environmental Protection and Management)', *The Indonesian Journal of International Clinical Legal Education*, 2 (2020), 43–56 <<https://doi.org/10.15294/IJICLE.V2I1.37328>>

Putri, Fatma Ayu Jati and Jasurbek Rustamovich Ehsonov, 'The Impact of Land Reform Policies on the Sustainable Management of Natural Resources in Local Communities', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 4 (2024), 510–37 <<https://doi.org/10.53955/JHCLS.V4I2.197>>

Rizqi, Alda Rifada, 'Meaningful Participation in Local Regulation Making in Indonesia: A Study of Legislative Law', *Rechtsidee*, 10 (2022) <<https://doi.org/10.21070/JIHR.V11I0.801>>

Rodiyah, Rodiyah, Siti Hafsyah Idris and Robert Brian Smith, 'Mainstreaming Justice in the Establishment of Laws and Regulations Process: Comparing Case in Indonesia, Malaysia, and Australia', *Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies*, 8 (2023), 333–78 <<https://doi.org/10.15294/JILS.V7I2.60096>>

Rosalina, Putu Devi, Karine Dupre, Ying Wang, I Nyoman Darma Putra and Xin Jin, 'Rural Tourism Resource Management Strategies: A Case Study of Two Tourism Villages in Bali', *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 49 (2023), 101194 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2023.101194>>

Safitri, Myrna A and Achmad Jaka Santos Adiwijaya, 'Realizing Ecological Justice in Urban Development Laws: Indonesian Experiences and Challenges to Protect Biodiversity in Its New Capital City', *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 1447 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/1447/1/012021>>

Samper-Mendívil, Maider, María Elena Aramendia-Muneta and Rocío Alarcón-López, 'Assessing Sustainability in Rural Tourism: Insights from Accommodation Managers and Residents in Navarre', *Journal of Rural Studies*, 120 (2025), 103866 <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2025.103866>>

Saputra, I Putu David Adi, 'Pentingnya Pariwisata Berkelanjutan Dalam Menjaga Keseimbangan Lingkungan', *AL-MIKRAJ Jurnal Studi Islam Dan Humaniora (E-ISSN 2745-4584)*, 4 (2024), 207–17 <<https://doi.org/10.37680/ALMIKRAJ.V4I02.4613>>

Sari, Norma, Choirul Fajri, Sri Winiarti, Ulaya Ahdiani and Sonny Zulhuda, 'The Regulations of Protection Tourists in High-Risk Tourism Destination', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 4 (2024), 803–21 <<https://doi.org/10.53955/JHCLS.V4I3.366>>

Soekanto, Soerjono, Sri Mamudji, *Penelitian Hukum Normatif: Suatu Tinjauan Singkat Cetakan Ke 17* (Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2015)

Streimikiene, Dalia, Biruta Svagzdiene, Edmundas Jasinskas and Arturas Simanavicius, 'Sustainable Tourism Development and Competitiveness: The Systematic Literature Review', *Sustainable Development*, 29 (2021), 259–71 <<https://doi.org/10.1002/SD.2133>>

Suhrab, Muhammad, Chen Pinglu and Ningyu Qian, 'Green Road to Sustainability: Impact of Urbanization on Environmental Degradation and the Mitigating Effect of Infrastructure Investment in Belt and Road Initiative Economies', *Sustainable Futures*, 10 (2025) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SFTR.2025.101080>>

Sutanto, Harry and . Nugroho J. Setiadi, 'Overtourism Sebagai Keniscayaan Dalam Pengelolaan Pariwisata Di Indonesia', *Jurnal Altasia*, 2 (2020) <<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.37253/altasia.v2i2.590>>

Syafii, Muhammad and Mimma Maripatul Uula, 'Measuring the Productivity of Tourism Sector in Indonesia', *Halal Tourism and Pilgrimage*, 2 (2022) <<https://doi.org/10.58968/HTP.V2I2.179>>

Tamrin, Irwan, 'Dari Sejarah Menuju Pengembangan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan: Studi Kasus



Kampung Wisata Pancer', *Jurnal Master Pariwisata (JUMPA)*, 8 (2021), 152 <<https://doi.org/10.24843/jumpa.2021.v08.i01.p08>>

Tamrin, Irwan, Rusdin Tahir, M Liga Suryadana and Arfah Sahabudin, 'Dari Sejarah Menuju Pengembangan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan: Studi Kasus Kampung Wisata Pancer', *Jurnal Master Pariwisata (JUMPA)*, 8 (2021), 152 <<https://doi.org/10.24843/jumpa.2021.v08.i01.p08>>

Tingting Duan, Xue Yang, Zhe Zhang, 'The Improvement of Legal System, Entrepreneur Immigration, and Corporate Cash Holdings', *International Review of Financial Analysis*, 89 (2023) <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.irfa.2023.102776>>

United Nation, 'Policy Brief: COVID-19 and Transforming Tourism', *United Nation*, 2020

United Nations Environment Programme, World Tourism Organization, *Making Tourism More Sustainable A Guide for Policy Makers*, UNEP, WTO, 2005

UYAR OĞUZ, Hande and Ahmet ASLAN, 'Redesigning Rural Space through Smart Ecotourism Villages: A Model Proposal Based on TOE Theory', *Cities*, 168 (2026), 106465 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cities.2025.106465>>

Wardana, Azna Abrory, 'Integration of Local Wisdom and Legal Certainty in the Development of Tourism Villages in Malang Regency', *Jurnal Ar Ro's Mandalika (Armada)*, 5 (2025), 110–26 <<https://doi.org/10.59613/ARMADA.V5I2.4851>>

Widiati, Ida Ayu Putu and Indah Permatasar, 'Strategi Pengembangan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan (Sustainable Tourism Development) Berbasis Lingkungan Pada Fasilitas Penunjang Pariwisata Di Kabupaten Badung', *Kertha Wicaksana*, 16 (2022) <<https://doi.org/10.22225/kw.16.1.2022.35-44>>

Widodo, Sugeng, 'Reformulation of Regional Autonomy Strategy for Tourism Development in Indonesia', *International Journal of Economics, Business and Management Studies*, 6 (2019), 247–60 <<https://doi.org/10.20448/802.61.247.260>>

Widyaningsih, Aulia Basundhari, Istijabatul Aliyah and Rufia Andisetyana Putri, 'Kesesuaian Sepuluh Destinasi Wisata Terhadap Konsep Community-Based Tourism Di Kecamatan Ngargoyoso, Karanganyar', *Region : Jurnal Pembangunan Wilayah Dan Perencanaan Partisipatif*, 17 (2022), 535–54 <<https://doi.org/10.20961/region.v17i2.43886>>

World Tourism Organization (UNWTO), *Sustainable Tourism for Development Guidebook* (Spain: Institutional and Corporate Relations Programme, 2013)

Yanan, Li, Muhammad Azzam Ismail and Asrul Aminuddin, 'How Has Rural Tourism Influenced the Sustainable Development of Traditional Villages? A Systematic Literature Review', *Heliyon*, 10 (2024), e25627 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2024.e25627>>

